

Message

---

**From:** Culligan, Kevin [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5AB7EF4A59614FD4B4485668C42818C7-KCULLIGA]  
**Sent:** 1/9/2018 2:44:36 PM  
**To:** Harvey, Reid [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8ec31caad5048db83f210032847de32-RHARVE02]; Zenick, Elliott [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b2eaa2a560d415fb7c8ce9bb56c7ce5-EZENICK]  
**CC:** Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]; Marks, Matthew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66cf58c470d84403af7d7dfd7efc8016-Marks, Matthew]; Skinner-Thompson, Jonathan [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=271caec1be3b462e97471ba0f3acfdc2-Skipper-Tho]  
**Subject:** FW: Follow-up on 111(b) and 111(d): Materials in prep for tomorrow's meeting  
**Attachments:** CAA section 111 briefing 1\_9\_18.pptx

For today's briefing

---

**From:** South, Peter  
**Sent:** Monday, January 08, 2018 3:33 PM  
**To:** Koerber, Mike <Koerber.Mike@epa.gov>; Henigin, Mary <Henigin.Mary@epa.gov>; Iglesias, Amber <Iglesias.Amber@epa.gov>; Rush, Alan <Rush.Alan@epa.gov>; Scott, Blanche <scott.blanche@epa.gov>; OAR Briefings <OAR\_Briefings@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Ashley, John <ashley.john@epa.gov>; Conner, Lisa <Conner.Lisa@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>; Eck, Janet <Eck.Janet@epa.gov>; Johnson, Tanya <Johnson.Tanya@epa.gov>; McKinney, Voronina <mckinney.voronina@epa.gov>; McLamb, Marguerite <McLamb.Marguerite@epa.gov>; Mills, Kathy <Mills.Kathy@epa.gov>; Morales, Mariel <Morales.Mariel@epa.gov>; Pemberton, Wanda <Pemberton.Wanda@epa.gov>; Srivastava, Ravi <Srivastava.Ravi@epa.gov>; Thompson, Fred <Thompson.Fred@epa.gov>; Tsirigotis, Peter <Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov>; Fruh, Steve <Fruh.Steve@epa.gov>; Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Fellner, Christian <Fellner.Christian@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Follow-up on 111(b) and 111(d): Materials in prep for tomorrow's meeting

I have attached the briefing materials in prep for tomorrow's section 111(b) and (d) follow-up meeting with Bill.

Please call me or Mike Koerber with any questions relating to this information.

Thank you.

Pete South  
OAR/OAQPS/IO  
U.S. EPA  
office: 919 541-5359  
cell: 919 599-7213

Organizer Wehrum, Bill Sent: Fri 12/22/2

Subject Follow-up Briefing Regarding Review of 111(b) and 111(d)

Location WJC-N 5400 + Video with CAQPS + 1 866-293-3188; Participant Code: 202-256-4000

Start time Tue 1/9/2018 4:00 PM ☐ All day event

End time Tue 1/9/2018 5:00 PM

**To:** Wehrum, Bill; Mandy Gunasekara ([Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov](mailto:Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov)); Harlow, David; Lewis, Josh; Tsigotis, Peter; Koerber, Mike; Fruh, Steve; Culligan, Kevin; Hutson, Nick; Swanson, Nicholas; Fellner, Christian; Dunham, Sarah; Reid Harvey; Schmidt, Lorie; Zenick, Elliott; Skinner-Thompson, Jonathan  
**Cc:** South, Peter; Johnson, Tanya; McKinney, Voronina; Eck, Janet



Wehrum Meeting  
Request - Follo...

Message

---

**From:** Snyder, Carolyn [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=4FAFC36D202F4DE3A925E1DF708EDD9E-SNYDER, CAR]  
**Sent:** 8/8/2018 4:33:03 PM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Subject:** Re: OMB Call

Thanks for the update

Carolyn Snyder  
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
[snyder.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:snyder.carolyn@epa.gov)  
202-343-9616

On Aug 8, 2018, at 11:14 AM, Bryson, Joe <[Bryson.Joe@epa.gov](mailto:Bryson.Joe@epa.gov)> wrote:

Carolyn,

Only somewhat EE-related discussion on OMB call was raised by Amanda Lee. She asked for explanation of how the CPP base case was modeled. Misha explained they used mass-based approach only (not rate-based) and did not represent EE (i.e., did not change the input demand). He added that a side case was done that included EE impacts using a significantly lower demand impact than was used in 2015 per discussion from last fall on the Repeal rule. She did not pursue the EE aspect any further.

Some other interesting tid bits I can share w/ you later.

Thanks,  
Joe

Joe Bryson  
Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

Message

---

**From:** Snyder, Carolyn [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=4FAFC36D202F4DE3A925E1DF708EDD9E-SNYDER, CAR]  
**Sent:** 9/27/2017 4:29:21 PM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Subject:** Fwd: Commitments made in RIA draft

FYI

Carolyn Snyder  
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
[snyder.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:snyder.carolyn@epa.gov)  
202-343-9616

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Stenhouse, Jeb" <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** September 27, 2017 at 12:27:34 PM EDT  
**To:** "Snyder, Carolyn" <[Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Haeuber, Richard" <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)>, "Harvey, Reid" <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>, "Gunning, Paul" <[Gunning.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Gunning.Paul@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Commitments made in RIA draft

Update from Erich on an RIA workgroup call:

"Dave just proposed that we remove statements regarding any time commitments for additional analysis in the draft RIA that goes to OMB today. The group on the call, including Kevin and Erika, was in agreement."

I don't know what effect that has on the recommendation I passed along below for Rick to write AI.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Snyder, Carolyn  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 27, 2017 12:13 PM  
**To:** Stenhouse, Jeb <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Haeuber, Richard <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)>; Harvey, Reid <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>; Gunning, Paul <[Gunning.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Gunning.Paul@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Commitments made in RIA draft

That sounds like a great path forward to me. Thanks.

Carolyn Snyder  
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
[snyder.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:snyder.carolyn@epa.gov)  
202-343-9616

On Sep 27, 2017, at 12:01 PM, Stenhouse, Jeb <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)> wrote:

I just spoke (separately) with Kevin Culligan and Dave Evans about this language.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Snyder, Carolyn  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 27, 2017 11:42 AM  
**To:** Haeuber, Richard <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)>; Stenhouse, Jeb <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Harvey, Reid <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>; Gunning, Paul <[Gunning.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Gunning.Paul@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Commitments made in RIA draft

I agree that it is important to not promise anything that would limit our options for next steps.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Carolyn Snyder  
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
[snyder.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:snyder.carolyn@epa.gov)  
202-343-9616

---

**From:** Haeuber, Richard  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 27, 2017 10:53 AM  
**To:** Stenhouse, Jeb <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Harvey, Reid <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>; Gunning, Paul <[Gunning.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Gunning.Paul@epa.gov)>;  
Snyder, Carolyn <[Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Commitments made in RIA draft

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

On Sep 27, 2017, at 7:24 AM, Stenhouse, Jeb <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)> wrote:

Please let me know if you have any direction regarding this language.

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Eschmann, Erich" <[Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov](mailto:Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** September 27, 2017 at 10:10:09 AM EDT  
**To:** "Stenhouse, Jeb" <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Commitments made in RIA draft

Jeb – Alex just flagged this language for me and I  
wanted to make sure we're comfortable with it:

## **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Erich Eschmann  
Clean Air Markets Division  
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone  
202 343-2359 Fax  
[eschmann.erich@epa.gov](mailto:eschmann.erich@epa.gov)

Message

---

**From:** Eschmann, Erich [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=8B9183A038DD46BA92F0AC3BD3C4C814-ESCHMANN.ER]  
**Sent:** 9/1/2017 12:31:11 PM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Subject:** RE: some draft EE language/bullets

These look perfect. Would it also be helpful to add what we were talking about in 2016 AEO to first bullet (if I remember the trend correctly)? Curious if you have thoughts on how to do number 4 – I might have an idea. Not sure if you want to hold that one back from a one-pager for now? Let me know if you want to discuss before the call.

Erich Eschmann  
Clean Air Markets Division  
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone  
202 343-2359 Fax  
[eschmann.erich@epa.gov](mailto:eschmann.erich@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 31, 2017 6:17 PM  
**To:** Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** some draft EE language/bullets

Hey Erich,

This is too long/wordy, has a little not obvious nuance that might be worth discussing, and does not include significant caveats that are needed in a couple places. That said, below is some draft EE language/bullets for Path B one-pager to react to. Email or call me before 9:30am Friday if you get a chance. I've shared w/ Carolyn who I expect will have a lot of comments/reactions. Not sure if I'll get a chance to get her input before the 9:30 call.

Thanks,  
Joe, 343-9631

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5



Joe Bryson  
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

Message

**From:** Eschmann, Erich [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=8B9183A038DD46BA92F0AC3BD3C4C814-ESCHMANN.ER]  
**Sent:** 9/20/2017 4:39:22 PM  
**To:** Stenhouse, Jeb [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=e8521e7f3aac43adbb52fac73cfb22da-Stenhouse, Jeb]; Snyder, Carolyn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4fafc36d202f4de3a925e1df708edd9e-Snyder, Car]; Haeuber, Richard [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=169f615923364f2cbd7ddb5f2a34a0a2-RHAEUBER]; Gunning, Paul [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f65040017f05429aa05572f096a50463-PGUNNING]  
**CC:** Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Subject:** FW: OMB Request for Review of Additional CPP Studies  
**Attachments:** additional studies.docx; DRAFT bullet points 092017 11am.docx; addendum.docx; criteria for additional studies cpp review ria 170920 v2.docx; proposal\_RIA\_2017.docx

Attaching a few draft documents in case they are helpful today:

- 1) "Additional studies" document that responds to OMB's request regarding the inclusion of additional studies
- 2) "Criteria for additional studies" was created by OP today and summarizes the "additional studies" document.
- 3) "Draft bullet points" discussing the use of AEO analysis
- 4) "Addendum" is the current working draft of the document that examines trends over time and EE sensitivities. This is a work in progress and is being distributed later today for wider staff review, and Friday for management review.
- 5) "Proposal RIA 2017" is the current working draft of the updated RIA.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Erich Eschmann  
Clean Air Markets Division  
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone  
202 343-2359 Fax  
[eschmann.erich@epa.gov](mailto:eschmann.erich@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Eschmann, Erich  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 19, 2017 4:52 PM  
**To:** Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>; Snyder, Carolyn <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>; Haeuber, Richard <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>; Gunning, Paul <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** OMB Request for Review of Additional CPP Studies

Attaching a first draft of the document

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thank you,

Erich Eschmann  
Clean Air Markets Division  
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone  
202 343-2359 Fax  
[eschmann.erich@epa.gov](mailto:eschmann.erich@epa.gov)

Message

---

**From:** Marten, Alex [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BBB5E4745E544893B0AA24FA0167A779-MARTEN, ALEX]  
**Sent:** 9/12/2017 9:25:15 PM  
**To:** Macpherson, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8bbdd3b262a14ab5ae26c5a745337667-Macpherson, Alex]; Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]; Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]; Evans, DavidA [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=876417a7feba454a88b56794c1727651-DEvans08]  
**Subject:** RE: draft email..and question about 2015

I'm good.

--

Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

---

**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 12, 2017 5:25 PM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: draft email..and question about 2015  
**Importance:** High

Last call...I need to send

---

**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 12, 2017 3:45 PM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** draft email..and question about 2015

All: See draft below. Edits and suggestions welcome before 4.30 when I plan to deliver email

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thank you very much for the assistance. Please don't hesitate to call me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,  
Alex

---

Alexander Macpherson, PhD  
Senior Economist  
Office of Air and Radiation  
US Environmental Protection Agency  
919-541-9770

Message

---

**From:** Pat Knight [pknight@synapse-energy.com]  
**Sent:** 7/28/2017 1:56:32 PM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]; Conlin, Beth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=2d2d8e6eaba04da08233b77385757dd2-Conlin, Bethann]  
**CC:** Max Chang [mchang@synapse-energy.com]  
**Subject:** RE: New version of EE tool  
**Attachments:** df-cpp-demand-side-ee (20170728).xlsm

Joe and Beth,

Attached is a new version of the EE tool. In this version I have done the following:

- Implemented a button that you will need to click any time you change the measure expiration schedule, and wish to recalculate the "CPP Analysis" savings trajectory
- Added a "flat" costs button, so you can easily model a single cost throughout the study period

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I will dig more into the embedded EE savings and the AEO working group later today and early next week.

I've also touched base with our analysts who I've pulled together to work on the EE journal article. We'd been working on an outline, and it could be helpful to share this with you in case EPA is still interested in helping to fund it. Are you available mid-next week (i.e., Wednesday or Thursday) to chat about this?

Thanks,  
Pat

---

Patrick Knight  
Synapse Energy Economics  
485 Massachusetts Ave, Suite 2  
Cambridge, MA 02139

Direct Line: 617-453-7051  
Main Synapse Line: 617-661-3248  
Email: pknight@synapse-energy.com

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe [mailto:Bryson.Joe@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 26, 2017 9:03 AM  
**To:** Pat Knight <pknight@synapse-energy.com>; Conlin, Beth <Conlin.Beth@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Max Chang <mchang@synapse-energy.com>  
**Subject:** RE: New version of EE tool

Thanks, Pat.

I'll have a little time to review before we talk. Had a good discussion w/ EIA folks yesterday. No big surprises, but understand their methods a little better.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

### Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Talk at 2pm. Invite includes call-in info.

Thanks,  
Joe

Joe Bryson  
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

---

**From:** Pat Knight [<mailto:pknight@synapse-energy.com>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 26, 2017 8:48 AM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe <[Bryson.Joe@epa.gov](mailto:Bryson.Joe@epa.gov)>; Conlin, Beth <[Conlin.Beth@epa.gov](mailto:Conlin.Beth@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Max Chang <[mchang@synapse-energy.com](mailto:mchang@synapse-energy.com)>  
**Subject:** New version of EE tool

Joe and Beth,

In advance of our phone call this afternoon, here is the latest version of the savings tool.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks, and we'll talk to you today at 2PM.  
-Pat

---

Patrick Knight  
Synapse Energy Economics  
485 Massachusetts Ave, Suite 2  
Cambridge, MA 02139

Direct Line: 617-453-7051

Main Synapse Line: 617-661-3248

Email: [pknight@synapse-energy.com](mailto:pknight@synapse-energy.com)



Message

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Sent:** 3/26/2018 6:17:15 PM  
**To:** Snyder, Carolyn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4fafc36d202f4de3a925e1df708edd9e-Snyder, Car]  
**Subject:** materials for Sarah briefing Weds on CPP & EE

Carolyn,

I wanted to touch base with you on Sarah briefing for Wednesday on CPP & EE.

I've done a short slide deck (~6 slides) as one option. I basically walk thru the #s that Erich provided for the discussion w/ Reid last week by breaking them down into parts.

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Joe

Joe Bryson  
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

Message

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDBD5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Sent:** 7/27/2017 10:33:10 PM  
**To:** Joe BrysonHome [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6]@me.com]  
**Subject:** Fwd: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)  
**Attachments:** Summary of Interagency Comments Under EO12866\_EPA CPP Review NPRM\_2060-A....docx; ATT00001.htm

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Snyder, Carolyn" <[Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** July 27, 2017 at 4:52:24 PM EDT  
**To:** "Bryson, Joe" <[Bryson.Joe@epa.gov](mailto:Bryson.Joe@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

Carolyn Snyder  
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
[snyder.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:snyder.carolyn@epa.gov)  
202-343-9616

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Harvey, Reid" <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** July 27, 2017 at 3:00:49 PM EDT  
**To:** "Haeuber, Richard" <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)>, "Stenhouse, Jeb" <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>, "Gunning, Paul" <[Gunning.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Gunning.Paul@epa.gov)>, "Snyder, Carolyn" <[Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

In case you haven't received this yet.

---

**From:** Culligan, Kevin  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 2:40 PM  
**To:** Harvey, Reid <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

**From:** Szabo, Aaron L. EOP/OMB [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 12:45 PM  
**To:** Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Laity, Jim A. EOP/OMB  
[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]; Dravis, Samantha <dravis.samantha@epa.gov>;  
Szabo, Aaron L. EOP/OMB [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]; Mancini, Dominic J.  
EOP/OMB [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]  
**Subject:** Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed  
Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

Attached please find the summary of interagency comments under EO 12866  
for the Regulatory Impact Analysis (RIA) for the EPA draft proposed rule  
entitled, "Review of the Clean Power Plan" (RIN 2060-AT55).

Please let me know if you have any questions.

**Aaron L. Szabo**  
Policy Analyst  
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs  
Office of Management and Budget

[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]

Message

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Sent:** 8/16/2017 3:54:14 PM  
**To:** Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]  
**Subject:** RE: Economic Analyses

EPRI slides on their modeling ... not sure if they have other documentation. Would be a good one to include if available.  
[http://www.rff.org/files/document/file/160211\\_CPPModelingForStrategicInsights\\_Niemeyer\\_0.pdf](http://www.rff.org/files/document/file/160211_CPPModelingForStrategicInsights_Niemeyer_0.pdf)

Thanks,  
Joe

Joe Bryson  
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

---

**From:** Eschmann, Erich  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 16, 2017 11:38 AM  
**To:** Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Economic Analyses

---

**From:** Eschmann, Erich  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 16, 2017 9:35 AM  
**To:** Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Economic Analyses

Jeb,

Here is a list of some recent analyses:

EIA (2017)  
<https://www.eia.gov/outlooks/aeo/>

WRI: comparison of various analyses (1/17)  
[http://www.wri.org/sites/default/files/The\\_Economic\\_Impacts\\_of\\_the\\_Clean\\_Power\\_Plan.pdf](http://www.wri.org/sites/default/files/The_Economic_Impacts_of_the_Clean_Power_Plan.pdf)

NERA (11/15)  
<http://www.nera.com/publications/archive/2015/energy-and-consumer-impacts-of-epas-clean-power-plan.html>

MJB&A (6/16)  
<http://www.mjbradley.com/reports/updated-modeling-analysis-epas-clean-power-plan>

C2ES: comparison of various analyses (9/16)  
<http://www.c2es.org/docUploads/insights-comparative-analysis-clean-power-plan-modeling.pdf>

BPC (6/16)

<https://bipartisanpolicy.org/library/clean-power-plan-analysis/>

Nicholas Institute (7/16)

[https://nicholasinstitute.duke.edu/sites/default/files/publications/ni\\_wp\\_16-07\\_final.pdf](https://nicholasinstitute.duke.edu/sites/default/files/publications/ni_wp_16-07_final.pdf)

Rhodium Group (5/16)

[http://rhg.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/AssessingCleanPowerPlan\\_EMI.pdf](http://rhg.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/AssessingCleanPowerPlan_EMI.pdf)

NRDC (6/16)

<https://www.nrdc.org/experts/david-doniger/new-nrdc-analysis-electric-sector-track-meet-clean-power-plan>

MISO (7/16)

<https://www.misoenergy.org/Library/Repository/Meeting%20Material/Stakeholder/PAC/2016/20160720/20160720%20PAC%20Item%2002a%20Clean%20Power%20Plan%20Study%20Report.pdf>

PJM/MISO (3/17)

<http://www.pjm.com/~media/library/reports-notice/clean-power-plan/20170310-pjm-miso-cpp-case-study.ashx>

PJM (9/16)

<http://www.pjm.com/~media/library/reports-notice/clean-power-plan/20160901-cpp-compliance-assessment.ashx>

Erich Eschmann  
Clean Air Markets Division  
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone  
202 343-2359 Fax  
[eschmann.erich@epa.gov](mailto:eschmann.erich@epa.gov)

Message

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Sent:** 8/16/2017 2:12:41 PM  
**To:** Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]  
**Subject:** Final CPP Analyses

Hey Erich,

Here are what I quickly found from the Google for MISO and PJM analyses. If these are of interest I think we'd want to reach out to contacts there to make sure we are using appropriate, final, up-to-date studies/results. I imagine WECC, ISO-NE, NY-ISO and other regions may have similar analyses.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

PJM Analysis of Final CPP – October 2016 (this is just ppt, the report link doesn't seem to work now?)

[https://www.eenews.net/assets/2016/10/13/document\\_cw\\_01.pdf](https://www.eenews.net/assets/2016/10/13/document_cw_01.pdf)

MISO Analysis of Final CPP – July 2016

<https://www.misoenergy.org/Library/Repository/Meeting%20Material/Stakeholder/PAC/2016/20160720/20160720%20PAC%20Item%2002a%20Clean%20Power%20Plan%20Study%20Report.pdf>

Join PJM-MISO Analysis of Final CPP – March 2017

<http://www.pjm.com/~media/library/reports-notice/clean-power-plan/20170310-pjm-miso-cpp-case-study.ashx>

One other group we should look for: RFF analysis of CPP?

Thanks,  
Joe

Joe Bryson  
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

Message

---

**From:** Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]  
**Sent:** 6/19/2017 2:51:12 PM  
**To:** Ian Hoffman [ihoffman@lbl.gov]; Lisa Schwartz [lcschwartz@lbl.gov]; Chuck Goldman (cagoldman@lbl.gov) [cagoldman@lbl.gov]  
**Subject:** Follow-up to Friday call: links to Final CPP Materials

Hey Gang,

Here are links to "archived" Final CPP documents:

General link:

<https://archive.epa.gov/epa/cleanpowerplan/clean-power-plan-existing-power-plants-regulatory-actions.html>

RIA (Chapter 3 has all the power sector modeling/results, including EE aspects):

<https://archive.epa.gov/epa/cleanpowerplan/clean-power-plan-final-rule-regulatory-impact-analysis.html>

Tech Support docs:

<https://archive.epa.gov/epa/cleanpowerplan/clean-power-plan-final-rule-technical-documents.html>

These are the two key EE ones – DS-EE TSD and associated spreadsheet using 3% discount:

- [Technical Support Document: Demand-side Energy Efficiency \(PDF\)\(105 pp, 1.1 MB, About PDF\)](#)
- [Data File: Demand-Side Energy Efficiency Appendix - Illustrative 3% Scenario \(XLSX\)\(2 MB\)](#)

Thanks for taking time for the call. I'll follow up further on as needed.

Thanks,  
Joe

Joe Bryson  
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division  
(202) 343-9631

Message

**From:** Joshua Bankert [JBankert@indecon.com]  
**Sent:** 4/10/2018 8:06:02 PM  
**To:** Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]; Stefani Penn [SPenn@indecon.com]; Chan, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8c2d189c5ca846a4b77b094a4e5b18db-Chan, Eliza]; Meredith Amend [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=user2ce93bb2]; Henry Roman [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=userc094bf11]  
**CC:** Baker, Kirk [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=af890a2a9b7642fca064aa58998b70f2-KBAKER]; Dolwick, Pat [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=76d17174a01f4ed3a33cd1c9b639ffc5-PDOLWIC]  
**Subject:** RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Fann, Neal [mailto:Fann.Neal@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, April 10, 2018 15:23  
**To:** Stefani Penn; Chan, Elizabeth; Meredith Amend; Joshua Bankert; Henry Roman  
**Cc:** Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat  
**Subject:** RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Stefani Penn [mailto:SPenn@indecon.com]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, April 10, 2018 12:38 PM  
**To:** Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Meredith Amend <mamend@indecon.com>; Joshua Bankert <JBankert@indecon.com>; Henry Roman <HRoman@indecon.com>  
**Cc:** Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Baker, Kirk <Baker.Kirk@epa.gov>; Dolwick, Pat <Dolwick.Pat@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Hi all,

The attached document contains the preliminary comparison statistics. I will show this and the figures I shared last week on screen during the call so we can look at the values together.

Thanks,  
Stef

**From:** Stefani Penn  
**Sent:** Friday, April 06, 2018 4:22 PM  
**To:** 'Chan, Elizabeth'; Meredith Amend; Joshua Bankert; Henry Roman



**Cc:** Fann, Neal; Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat

**Subject:** RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Hi all,

The updated results are saved on the collaboration site under **AP3 – BenMAP Runs > Updated Results (4.5.2018)** and **CMAQ-BenMAP Policy Scenario Application > Updated Results (4.5.2018).**

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I was limited in my ability to provide you with both figures or stats results by the end of today, so I opted for figures since those are more likely to generate discussion for our call Tuesday. Please let me know if you have any questions, or would like to see any additional comparisons or details before Tuesday.

Best,  
Stef

---

**From:** Chan, Elizabeth [<mailto:Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, April 03, 2018 4:29 PM

**To:** Stefani Penn; Meredith Amend; Joshua Bankert; Henry Roman

**Cc:** Fann, Neal; Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat

**Subject:** Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Hello IEC,

As per our conversation earlier this afternoon, attached you will find a PPT with screenshots and the Tableau workbook where the images were created.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Elizabeth

-----Original Appointment-----

**From:** Stefani Penn [<mailto:SPenn@indecon.com>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, April 03, 2018 2:20 PM

**To:** Meredith Amend; Fann, Neal; Chan, Elizabeth; Joshua Bankert; Jenkins, Scott; Zawacki, Margaret; Henry Roman;

Davidson, Ken; Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat; Acadia

**Subject:** Reduced Form Tools Update

**When:** Tuesday, April 03, 2018 3:00 PM-4:00 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

**Where:**

## Agenda

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

AP3 update

## Reduced Form Tools Call (Penn)

Tue, Apr 3, 2018 3:00 PM - 4:00 PM EDT

Please join my meeting from your computer, tablet or smartphone.

<https://global.gotomeeting.com/join/322760877>

You can also dial in using your phone.

United States: +1 (786) 535-3211

Access Code:

First GoToMeeting? Let's do a quick system check: <https://link.gotomeeting.com/system-check>

Message

---

**From:** Wayland, Richard [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=D69FOA870909402EBD66847003AA6437-WAYLAND, CHET]  
**Sent:** 4/13/2018 12:34:09 PM  
**To:** Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]; Fox, Tyler [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=021c57f288da44738d9dea325aadad85-TFOX]  
**CC:** Simon, Heather [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=a777b3ab435946d399a5ac22de5de197-Simon, Heather]; Possiel, Norm [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=89e1e9284df646adaf76cc6bd02aceb6-NPOSSIEL]  
**Subject:** RE: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Thanks Neal.

Richard A. "Chet" Wayland | Director | Air Quality Assessment Division - Mail Code C304-02 | Office of Air Quality Planning & Standards | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency | Research Triangle Park, NC 27711 | Desk: 919-541-4603 | Cell: 919-606-0548 |

---

**From:** Fann, Neal  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 12, 2018 2:07 PM  
**To:** Fox, Tyler <Fox.Tyler@epa.gov>; Wayland, Richard <Wayland.Richard@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>; Possiel, Norm <Possiel.Norm@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Fann, Neal  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 11, 2018 5:14 PM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Wayland, Robertj <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

-Neal

**From:** Keaveny, Brian

**Sent:** Wednesday, April 11, 2018 4:39 PM

**To:** Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Wayland, Robertj <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Thanks a bunch Neal and Heather! This is helpful and interesting.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Fann, Neal

**Sent:** Wednesday, April 11, 2018 4:10 PM

**To:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Wayland, Robertj <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>

**Subject:** Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Hi all,

I wanted to share with you the preliminary estimates of the foregone PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone-related benefits of the CPP replacement policies.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,  
Neal

**PM<sub>2.5</sub> & Ozone**

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Message

---

**From:** Stenhouse, Jeb [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=E8521E7F3AAC43ADBB52FAC73CFB22DA-STENHOUSE, JEB]  
**Sent:** 8/30/2017 5:28:57 PM  
**To:** Harvey, Reid [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8ec31caad5048db83f210032847de32-RHARVE02]  
**Subject:** FW: Initial observations re: EIA AEO CPP analytics

FYI

---

**From:** Stenhouse, Jeb  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 30, 2017 1:28 PM  
**To:** Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Macpherson, Alex <Macpherson.Alex@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Initial observations re: EIA AEO CPP analytics

Hi Darryl, Brian, Alex, and Erich,

To keep us on the same page going into meetings today, tomorrow, and whenever else with respect to this “alternative approach” examining EIA AEO analyses of the Clean Power Plan, here are my initial observations that may come in handy, Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jeb

Message

---

**From:** Haeuber, Richard [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=169F615923364F2CBD7DDB5F2A34A0A2-RHAEUBER]  
**Sent:** 11/7/2017 3:42:23 PM  
**To:** Harvey, Reid [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8ec31caad5048db83f210032847de32-RHARVE02]  
**Subject:** Fwd: IPM runs

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "McGartland, Al" <[McGartland.Al@epa.gov](mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** November 6, 2017 at 6:28:15 PM EST  
**To:** "Haeuber, Richard" <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Marten, Alex" <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>, "Evans, DavidA" <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>, "Stenhouse, Jeb" <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: IPM runs

Thanks Rick. It would be good to stay in close contact. Dave and alex will connect with Jeb.

Samantha wants to know where we are with the new analysis. I'm scheduled to meet with her a week from Friday on a wide range of issues and I suspect this will be on the agenda.

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 6, 2017, at 4:45 PM, Haeuber, Richard <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)> wrote:

Al,

Sorry it's take a bit for me to get back to you - it's been a jammed day.

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**



# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I'm happy to talk further as well.

Thanks

Richard Haeuber, Ph.D.  
Acting Director, Clean Air Markets Division  
Office of Atmospheric Programs  
USEPA  
202-343-9250

-----Original Message-----

From: McGartland, Al  
Sent: Monday, November 06, 2017 11:59 AM  
To: Haeuber, Richard <[Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov)>  
Cc: Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>; Stenhouse, Jeb <[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov](mailto:Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov)>  
Subject: IPM runs

Hi Rick. We are anxious to see the IPM runs that are available. I heard that both the new baseline and two cpp runs (varying EE) are available.

It is important that we receive the output files quickly. We need to build in what approximately what the new cost numbers will be for our regulatory budget among other things. Can you all send to Dave and Alex.

Thanks.

Sent from my iPhone

Message

---

**From:** Harvey, Reid [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=F8EC31CAAD5048DB83F210032847DE32-RHARVE02]  
**Sent:** 4/27/2018 4:04:32 PM  
**To:** Mikhail Adamantiades (Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]  
**Subject:** FW: Thoughts for today's OMB discussion

Not sure why he didn't include you on this...

---

**From:** Culligan, Kevin  
**Sent:** Friday, April 27, 2018 11:51 AM  
**To:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Thoughts for today's OMB discussion

In an effort to make sure that we are on the same page in today's call (I am pretty sure we are), I wanted to lay out some thoughts in advance of the call:

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Message

---

**From:** Harvey, Reid [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=F8EC31CAAD5048DB83F210032847DE32-RHARVE02]  
**Sent:** 3/7/2018 1:52:11 PM  
**To:** Snyder, Carolyn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4fafc36d202f4de3a925e1df708edd9e-Snyder, Car]  
**Subject:** FW: CPP RIA Questions/Comments  
**Attachments:** cpp replacement ria questions.docx

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Reid

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Sasser, Erika  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 07, 2018 8:18 AM  
**To:** Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: CPP RIA Questions/Comments

Hi Reid-- can you give me a call this morning, if you get a chance?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

thanks

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Weatherhead, Darryl  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 06, 2018 3:24 PM  
**To:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: CPP RIA Questions/Comments

Just for you to be aware of their questions.

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Monday, March 05, 2018 8:15 AM  
**To:** Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** CPP RIA Questions/Comments

Hi Darryl and Jeb,

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Alex and Dave

--

Alex Marten  
marten.alex@epa.gov

**Sent:** 6/28/2018 12:31:23 PM  
**To:** Culligan, Kevin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5ab7ef4a59614fd4b4485668c42818c7-KCULLIGA]; Sasser, Erika [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=477638fe84004800bdfd8e62fe3cafc8-ESASSER]; Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]; Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]  
**CC:** Hutson, Nick [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7e6dc331d174798a3a269070576d896-Hutson, Nick]; Swanson, Nicholas [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3a03c53d255d4581acb3cb66f04e5df1-Swanson, Nicholas]  
**Subject:** RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

---

**From:** Culligan, Kevin  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 27, 2018 6:09 PM  
**To:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

I suggested edits in two areas:

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Sasser, Erika  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 27, 2018 5:50 PM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Hi Brian—I think the ex sum looks very good. I had a few minor comments (marked as OAQPS/Erika Sasser) but overall I think this looks right on. Good to send forward when you all are ready.

**From:** Keaveny, Brian [mailto:no-reply@sharepointonline.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 27, 2018 12:44 PM  
**To:** Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Hi Erika and Kevin,

Here is a link to the draft 111(d) executive summary ready for your review today.

FYI, there are a couple of limited portions still being edited. In particular, Nick Hutson and I are working on wrapping up section 1.2 today. Please don't feel compelled to read through the unresolved comment bubbles - we'll take care of them.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,  
- Brian

## Open ch1 - executive summ.docx

See more related to Keaveny, Brian in Delve.



Get the SharePoint mobile app!



Message

---

**Sent:** 7/3/2018 4:29:12 PM  
**To:** Svendsgaard, Dave [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d43d5bfb57654651a3bd6656d7c851e9-DSVENDSG]  
**Subject:** RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Sure.

---

**From:** Svendsgaard, Dave  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 03, 2018 12:27 PM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Yep that'll work. Thanks

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 03, 2018 12:05 PM  
**To:** Svendsgaard, Dave <Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Hi Dave,

Good question. Unfortunately, I don't know what the RIA title is going to be. It often has to change late in the process for reasons outside of our control.

Could you refer to the "regulatory impact analysis (RIA) for this action" and mention that it is located in the docket for this action?

- Brian

---

**From:** Svendsgaard, Dave  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 03, 2018 11:57 AM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Brian,  
If I cite to the RIA, what is the proper title and cite?

Dave

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Friday, June 22, 2018 12:49 PM  
**To:** Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>; Svendsgaard, Dave <Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Hi Dave and Misha,

I would actually suggest

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

- Brian

---

**From:** Adamantiades, Mikhail

**Sent:** Friday, June 22, 2018 12:21 PM

**To:** Svendsgaard, Dave <[Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov](mailto:Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Keaveny, Brian <[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov](mailto:Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov)>; Eschmann, Erich <[Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov](mailto:Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Svendsgaard, Dave

**Sent:** Friday, June 22, 2018 12:16 PM

**To:** Adamantiades, Mikhail <[Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov](mailto:Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Keaveny, Brian <[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov](mailto:Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RIA references in CPP NSR section

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5



U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
OAQPS/AQPD/NSRG (C504-03)  
109 T.W. Alexander Drive  
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711  
Phone (919) 541-2380

Note: Positions or views expressed here do not represent official EPA policy.

Message

---

**Sent:** 7/2/2018 2:16:37 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]  
**CC:** Evans, DavidA [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=876417a7feba454a88b56794c1727651-DEvans08]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Hi Ann,

Thanks again for your help with the 111(d) RIA chapter on economic and employment impacts.

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 29, 2018 7:11 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Hi Ann,

Thanks for adding the footnote, and for letting me know.

Thanks,  
- Brian

---

**From:** Ferris, Ann  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 29, 2018 2:55 PM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 22, 2018 8:53 AM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Ferris, Ann  
**Sent:** Monday, May 21, 2018 12:10 PM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov](mailto:Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov)>; Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Friday, May 18, 2018 5:07 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Thanks Alex, I appreciate you crafting updated text on the distribution of costs. I'll take a look at this new text in SharePoint.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
- Brian

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, May 18, 2018 10:18 AM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov](mailto:Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--  
Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 17, 2018 11:18 AM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov](mailto:Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--  
Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 17, 2018 11:16 AM  
**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I'm happy to chat if needed. Thanks for your help.

- Brian

---

**From:** Marten, Alex

**Sent:** Thursday, May 17, 2018 10:59 AM

**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--  
Alex Marten

phone: (202) 566-2301

email: marten.alex@epa.gov

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian

**Sent:** Friday, May 11, 2018 3:59 PM

**To:** Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>

**Subject:** draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Hi Ann,

I'm reaching out to share the draft *Economic and Employment Impacts* chapter for the 111(d) replacement proposal RIA. I would appreciate your review and suggested edits. Please feel free to make edits in the SharePoint document using Tracked Changes. I'd be happy to chat sometime soon if it would be helpful.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks in advance for your help with this.

- Brian

---

Brian Keaveny, Economist

Air Economics Group, HEID/OAQPS

U.S. EPA Office of Air and Radiation  
MD C439-02, 109 TW Alexander Dr., RTP, NC 27711  
Phone: 919-541-5238

Message

---

**Sent:** 8/7/2018 2:46:10 PM  
**To:** Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]  
**Subject:** FW: text added to preamble

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 07, 2018 10:37 AM  
**To:** Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: text added to preamble

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Ashley, Jackie  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 07, 2018 10:13 AM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: text added to preamble

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 07, 2018 10:11 AM  
**To:** Ashley, Jackie <[Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov](mailto:Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: text added to preamble

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Keaveny, Brian  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 07, 2018 9:38 AM  
**To:** Swanson, Nicholas <[Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov](mailto:Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** text added to preamble

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

-----  
Brian Keaveny, Economist  
Air Economics Group, HEID/OAQPS  
U.S. EPA Office of Air and Radiation  
MD C439-02, 109 TW Alexander Dr., RTP, NC 27711  
Phone: 919-541-5238



Message

**From:** Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]  
**Sent:** 9/27/2018 2:59:45 PM  
**To:** Ashley, Jackie [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=01a9a3cadfa14c509d09cdae3498dd43-JASHLEY]  
**CC:** Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]  
**Subject:** RE: Brian - could you fact check?

Hi Jackie,

I think your language is good as it is.

- Brian

-----Original Message-----

From: Ashley, Jackie  
Sent: Thursday, September 27, 2018 10:05 AM  
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
Cc: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>  
Subject: RE: Brian - could you fact check?

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: Keaveny, Brian  
Sent: Thursday, September 27, 2018 9:23 AM  
To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>  
Cc: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>  
Subject: RE: Brian - could you fact check?

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

-----Original Message-----

From: Ashley, Jackie  
Sent: Thursday, September 27, 2018 8:59 AM  
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
Subject: Brian - could you fact check?

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards - 919-541-7664 -  
ashley.jackie@epa.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: Jed Dukett [mailto:jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org]  
Sent: Friday, September 21, 2018 9:30 AM  
To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>  
Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
Subject: RE: Inquiry about ACE rule

Jackie,

I recently received some information from a group that is concerned about the new ACE rule. Is the following statement true? It seems to directly speak to EPA's work on this ACE rule and figured it was fair to ask.

"The Trump administration recently announced its intention to roll back pollution controls on coal burning power plants by replacing the EPA's Clean Power Plan (CPP) with the Affordable Clean Energy rule. By EPA's own admission, the new proposed rule could lead (per year) to as many as 1,630 premature deaths, 96,000 new cases of exacerbated asthma, 48,000 lost work days and 140,000 lost school days, compared to leaving the CPP in place. "

I am just trying to understand the truth, so I too can answer questions.

Thank You  
Jed

James (Jed) Dukett  
Program Manager  
Adirondack Lakes Survey Corporation  
Ray Brook, NY 12977  
518-897-1375  
www.adirondacklakessurvey.org

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>  
> To: Jed Dukett <jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org>  
> Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
> Subject: RE: Inquiry about ACE rule  
> Sent: Aug 23 '18 16:14

>  
> Jed -  
> As proposed, ACE would rebalance roles and responsibilities and give states the primary authority for determining what emissions controls actually need to be established for power plants within their jurisdictions. For this reason, the analyses are illustrative. However, we note (as you did) that emissions in the power sector have steadily declined in recent years due to a range of factors. EPA projects the ACE rule will continue this trend.

>  
> -Jackie

>  
> -----  
> Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards  
> - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Jed Dukett [mailto:jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org]  
> Sent: Thursday, August 23, 2018 3:31 PM  
> To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>  
> Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>  
> Subject: Re: Inquiry about ACE rule

>  
> Jackie,

>  
> Thank you for the quick follow-up. I have been doing acid deposition monitoring for over 25 years in the Adirondack Mountains. We have seen marked recovery in our waters to the point that now we are doing a project that involves restoring brook trout. That is good news! The 1990 CAAA has been a wonderful success, something we should all be proud of.

>  
> So naturally, I am trying to discern what is going on with emissions and this new plan; and of course folks are writing things and asking questions that make me wonder what will happen. We don't want to go backwards.

>

> If I can ask, and I am not sure if this is an EPA question solely, but could this ACE rule benefit coal emissions should incentives or innovation make its way into making coal competitive in the marketplace?

>

> Thanks Again,

> Jed

>

> James (Jed) Dukett

> Program Manager

> Adirondack Lakes Survey Corporation

> Ray Brook, NY 12977

> 518-897-1354

> www.adirondacklakessurvey.org

>

>

> > -----Original Message-----

> > From: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov> > To:

> jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org >

> <jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org>

> > Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov> > Subject: Inquiry

> about ACE rule > Sent: Aug 23 '18 14:11 > > > Mr. Dukett - >

> > Thank you for your inquiry about EPA's proposed Affordable Clean >

> Energy rule. I'm happy to try to help.

> >

> > Information about potential impacts of the proposed ACE rule, >

> including changes in power sector emissions of SO2 and NOx, is >

> available in the Regulatory Impact Analysis at >

> [https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2018-08/documents/utilities\\_ria\\_proposed\\_ace\\_2018-08.pdf](https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2018-08/documents/utilities_ria_proposed_ace_2018-08.pdf).

> > In particular, Table 3-7 in the RIA (on page 3-16) provides

> projected > power sector emissions of SO2 and NOx for the base case

> and all > illustrative cases. This table shows that EPA projects

> power sector > SO2 emissions to be less than 1 million tons per year

> for all > years/cases and power sector NOx emissions to be less than

> 0.9 million > tons per year for all years/cases.

> >

> > I hope this information is helpful. If you have additional

> questions > about the RIA, please feel free to contact me or my

> colleague Brian > Keaveny (Keaveny.brian@epa.gov).

> >

> > Thank you,

> >

> > Jackie Ashley

> >

> > -----

> >

> > Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and

> Standards > - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov > > Hello

> Peter, > > I am trying to understand the new ACE rule and what it

> will do to > National SO2 and NOx emissions. I believe your data

> shows both > pollutants were below 1.5million tons through 2016.

> Under the new ACE > rule, will this level now be exceeded for either

> of these pollutants?

> >

> > Thank You,

> >

> > Jed Dukett

> >

> > James (Jed) Dukett

> >

> > Program Manager

> >

> > Adirondack Lakes Survey Corporation > > Ray Brook, NY 12977 >

> > 518-897-1354 > > www.adirondacklakessurvey.org > >

>

Message

**From:** Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]  
**Sent:** 8/24/2018 9:35:23 PM  
**To:** Thompson, Lisa [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c4fe265551504398a47a9049eba0aa13-Thompson, L]; Nicholas Swanson (Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3a03c53d255d4581acb3cb66f04e5df1-Swanson, Nicholas]  
**CC:** Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]; Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]  
**Subject:** RIA-related files to docket - batch #2 of multiple  
**Attachments:** 2 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.XLSX; 4.5 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.XLSX; 4.5 percent HRI at \$100 per kW SSR.XLSX; Base Case (CPP) SSR.XLSX; Base Case (CPP) with EE SSR.XLSX; documentation\_v6\_propose\_ace.pdf; Media and phys item.pdf; needs\_v6\_proposed\_ace\_rule.xlsx; No CPP SSR.XLSX

Hi Lisa and Nick,

Attached is batch #2 of RIA-related files for the docket.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,  
- Brian

## Batch #2

| Row # | Name of File                             | Description  | Document Citation or Title  |
|-------|--|--|---|
| 11    | Base Case (CPP) SSR.xlsx                 | This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year. | IPM System Summary Report: Base Case (CPP)                          |
| 12    | 2 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.xlsx    | This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year. | IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative 2 percent HRI at \$50/kW    |
| 13    | 4.5 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.xlsx  | This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year. | IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative 4.5 percent HRI at \$50/kW  |
| 14    | 4.5 percent HRI at \$100 per kW SSR.xlsx | This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year. | IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative 4.5 percent HRI at \$100/kW |

|    |                                  |  |  |
|----|----------------------------------|--|--|
| 15 | No CPP SSR.xlsx                  | This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.   | IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative No CPP                               |
| 16 | Base Case (CPP) with EE SSR.xlsx | This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.   | IPM System Summary Report: Base Case (CPP) with EE                           |
| 17 | needs_v6_proposed_ace_rule.xlsx  | The National Electric Energy Data System or "NEEDS" database contains the generation unit records used to construct the "model" plants that represent existing and planned/committed units in EPA modeling applications of IPM. NEEDS includes basic geographic, operating, air emissions, and other data on these generating units.   | NEEDS v6 Database for Proposed ACE Rule (rev: 03-12-2018)                    |
| 18 | Media and phys item.pdf          | This docket item contains detailed IPM output files for the RIA scenarios. Files included for each scenario are: RPE, RPT, DAT, and overview file.   | IPM Run Files  |
| 19 | documentation_v6_propose_ace.pdf | For the power sector analysis of the proposed ACE Rule, the EPA used an earlier version of the model that is slightly different than the version documented on EPA's Power Sector Modeling Platform v6 using IPM website. This document catalogues the assumptions that differ from those published in the complete EPA Platform v6 documentation, and is applicable to modeling scenarios supporting the proposed ACE rule. | Incremental Documentation for EPA Platform v6 used for the Proposed ACE Rule |

## Appointment

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]  
**Sent:** 6/27/2018 9:35:06 PM  
**To:** Keaveny, Brian [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=13ac837699a94966adb381b8c7c380f9-Keaveny, Br]; Hutson, Nick [Hutson.Nick@epa.gov]; Evans, DavidA [Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]  
**Subject:** plan for documenting 111(d) scenario assumptions  
**Location:** RTP-OAQPS [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6] HEID/Phone-Line/RTP-OAQPS-BLDG-C (RTP-OAQPS [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6] HEID@epa.gov)  
**Start:** 6/28/2018 7:00:00 PM  
**End:** 6/28/2018 7:30:00 PM  
**Show Time As:** Tentative

Hi Everyone,

This time is for us to touch base briefly and decide **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Nick, I see that your calendar tomorrow looks pretty packed (understandably). Hopefully this time works for you. If not, please propose another time. It'd be really helpful to talk sometime soon so we can make headway on drafting this text for the RIA.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
- Brian

Message

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=36369CD40CCB428BAECCEC8B2BC3B74B-EKOPITS]  
**Sent:** 7/17/2017 8:06:08 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b758de97ccf34e8884c4a3752fce4ac5-Cardamone, Kathleen]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Newbold, Steve [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=962edb2d8cff4cecafa77768ab652c97-snewbold]; Griffiths, Charles [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b6cf9d6d6dd24f5c825170cddcd13e4c-Griffiths, Charles]; Wolverton, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5f7d06177f3e4b75918323aeaa2cee3f-AWolvert]; Sarofim, Marcus [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8557a127ac804a9dbb76e8b726eaba09-Sarofim, Marcus]  
**Subject:** RE: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers  
**Attachments:** draft writeup for scch4 - SN alm ks\_ek\_CLEAN.docx; draft writeup for scch4 - SN alm ks\_ek.docx

Hi All,

Thanks for the great edits and comments all around. Attached is an updated draft – both a tracked changes and a cleaner version. We still need to add in the histogram, and I will do some more QAQC of the numbers tomorrow, but in the meantime please let me know if you have any concerns or see any mistakes in the revisions in the writeup.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks!  
Elizabeth

---

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Monday, July 17, 2017 10:49 AM  
**To:** Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Newbold, Steve <Newbold.Steve@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Sarofim, Marcus <Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

Likewise, thanks, Elizabeth, for the draft. I've layered my comments on top of Steve's and Alex's comments.

---

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, July 14, 2017 4:57 PM  
**To:** Newbold, Steve <Newbold.Steve@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Shouse, Kate <Shouse.Kate@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Sarofim, Marcus <Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

Thank you Elizabeth for pulling this together. This looks really good! In the attached I only have a few very minor suggestions on top of Steve's.

Per your questions:

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--  
Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

---

**From:** Newbold, Steve  
**Sent:** Friday, July 14, 2017 3:51 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth <[Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Shouse, Kate <[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov](mailto:Shouse.Kate@epa.gov)>; Griffiths, Charles <[Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov](mailto:Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov)>; Wolverton, Ann <[Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov)>; Sarofim, Marcus <[Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov](mailto:Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

Hi Elizabeth,

The attached version contains some (mostly minor and mostly editorial) suggested edits.

\*\*\*\*\*

Steve Newbold  
U.S. EPA



National Center for Environmental Economics (NCEE)  
EPA West, 4316T, MC 1809T  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202) 566-2293

\*\*\*\*\*

---

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 13, 2017 11:42 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate; Newbold, Steve; Griffiths, Charles; Wolverton, Ann; Sarofim, Marcus  
**Subject:** FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

DRAFT DELIBERATIVE

Hi All,

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

If you have strong opinions on any of these issues, please let me know. I'm also happy to set up a time to discuss early next week.

Finally, it goes without saying that this is all draft, deliberative and close hold.

Best,  
Elizabeth

Message

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 6/14/2017 3:56:31 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]  
**CC:** Guignet, Dennis [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=e792beff70b642feb8b14bd77566eaca-Guignet, Dennis]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Massey, Matt [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=2109aa2ba51d4497b98bd1bbcef98afa-Massey, Matt]; Simpson, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=55f0b88e811c455290aa34fc8f7bd491-DSimps05]  
**Subject:** RE: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Thanks Ann.

---

**From:** Ferris, Ann  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 14, 2017 11:06 AM  
**To:** McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Guignet, Dennis <Guignet.Dennis@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; Simpson, David <Simpson.David@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Hi Al,

I've attached an alternative draft "just in case". It's far too long -- but I couldn't find a shorter version to pull from this morning.

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Thanks,  
Ann

---

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 14, 2017 9:21 AM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann  
**Cc:** Guignet, Dennis; Marten, Alex; Massey, Matt; Simpson, David  
**Subject:** Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 14, 2017, at 8:33 AM, Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)> wrote:

Thanks, Alex and Denny.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Ann

---

**From:** Guignet, Dennis

**Sent:** Wednesday, June 14, 2017 8:14 AM

**To:** Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Massey, Matt; Simpson, David; Ferris, Ann

**Subject:** Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Denny  
202-566-1573

---

**From:** Marten, Alex

**Sent:** Tuesday, June 13, 2017 10:53 PM

**To:** McGartland, Al; Massey, Matt; Guignet, Dennis; Simpson, David; Ferris, Ann  
**Subject:** Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Thanks Al.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Alex Marten  
[marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

---

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 13, 2017 10:11 PM  
**To:** Massey, Matt; Guignet, Dennis; Simpson, David; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** Fwd: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

FYI.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Dorjets, Vlad EOP/OMB" <[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov](mailto:Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov)>  
**Date:** June 13, 2017 at 9:47:19 PM EDT  
**To:** "McGartland, Al" <[McGartland.Al@epa.gov](mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov)>, "Hewitt, Julie" <[Hewitt.Julie@epa.gov](mailto:Hewitt.Julie@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Owens, Nicole" <[Owens.Nicole@epa.gov](mailto:Owens.Nicole@epa.gov)>, "Eisenberg, Mindy" <[Eisenberg.Mindy@epa.gov](mailto:Eisenberg.Mindy@epa.gov)>, "Nickerson, William" <[Nickerson.William@epa.gov](mailto:Nickerson.William@epa.gov)>, "Laity, Jim A. EOP/OMB" <[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov](mailto:Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov)>, "Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB" <[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov](mailto:Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov)>  
**Subject:** Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Al/Julie,

As discussed on our call earlier today, I want to pass along some comments on the draft EA for your consideration while we continue to have some internal discussion

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if you have any questions.

Vlad

Message

---

**From:** Evans, DavidA [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=876417A7FEBA454A88B56794C1727651-DEVANS08]  
**Sent:** 7/12/2018 5:28:26 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]  
**CC:** Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]; Jenkins, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=24d256fe39284600871e89c26f9b2613-Jenkins, Robin]; Snyder, Brett [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d518eda60c7140919e3f6e366792e578-Snyder, Brett]; Bowen, Jennifer [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66a625cf6b314520a04341a37cb0da16-JBowen03]; Thompson, Tammy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7cb27541e2b4152a884772302b07a18-Thompson, T]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]  
**Subject:** RE: Items to follow up with Erika on

Al,

I'd also mention that we may have other comments as we get a chance to review parts of the RIA and based on the outcome of ongoing staff discussions.

Dave

---

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 12, 2018 1:20 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Elizabeth Kopits <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Jenkins, Robin <Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov>; Brett Snyder <Snyder.Brett@epa.gov>; Jennifer Bowen <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Thompson, Tammy <thompson.tammy@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Items to follow up with Erika on

Hi Al,

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Hope this list works for you,

Dave

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**



Message

---

**From:** Evans, DavidA [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=876417A7FEBA454A88B56794C1727651-DEVANS08]  
**Sent:** 7/10/2018 10:22:59 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]  
**CC:** Thompson, Tammy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7cb27541e2b4152a884772302b07a18-Thompson, T]; Snyder, Brett [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d518eda60c7140919e3f6e366792e578-Snyder, Brett]  
**Subject:** Accounting for changes in Upstream Emissions  
**Attachments:** appendix 3a cpp-final-rule-ria.pdf; memo upstream methane changes v1.docx

Al, Alex and Elizabeth,

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Happy to share my spreadsheet once I've cleaned it up a bit.

## **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Let me know if you have any questions,

Dave

Message

---

**From:** Evans, DavidA [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=876417A7FEBA454A88B56794C1727651-DEVANS08]  
**Sent:** 6/6/2018 7:24:03 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]  
**CC:** Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]  
**Subject:** Will called

Al,

Will called me. He is going to change the sentence to something like:

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Dave

Message

---

**From:** Wolverton, Ann [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5F7D06177F3E4B75918323AEAA2CEE3F-AWOLVERT]  
**Sent:** 5/24/2018 7:12:31 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]  
**Subject:** RE: Employment effects language

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Ferris, Ann  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2018 3:06 PM  
**To:** Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Employment effects language

Thanks, Ann.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if Al has thoughts, suggestions, etc. and when we can send along to Bill.

Thanks,  
Ann

---

**From:** Wolverton, Ann  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2018 2:53 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>; Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Employment effects language

I have had a bit more time to reflect on this and I think what I would like to propose is as follows:

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Bill replied that an EA from his office may go to OMB tomorrow. The EA he's working on may go to OMB in a few weeks.

Alex – do we want to run this by AI before sending along to Bill?

Thanks,  
Ann

564-3207

---

**From:** Wolverton, Ann  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2018 1:31 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Employment effects language

Here are my recommended changes to the additional sentences to broaden them a bit while acknowledging the relevance of the SAB process to labor impacts:

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2018 1:13 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Wolverton, Ann <[Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Employment effects language

+ Ann W.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--  
Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Ferris, Ann  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2018 12:06 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Employment effects language

Hi Alex,

Bill Silagi asks how to update the economy-wide SAB language in an employment impact analysis in an EA.

Here's a modified paragraph you helped draft for a recent RIA – would this work? What do you think?

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Ann

564-3207

---

**From:** Silagi, William  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2018 9:50 AM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Employment effects language

Ann,

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



Message

---

**From:** Griffiths, Charles [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=B6CF9D6D6DD24F5C825170CDDCD13E4C-GRIFFITHS, CHARLES]  
**Sent:** 6/9/2017 8:32:58 PM  
**To:** Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Dockins, Chris [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3c8db533f0c847c98d706f1a52b0482b-CDockins]  
**CC:** Bowen, Jennifer [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66a625cf6b314520a04341a37cb0da16-JBowen03]; Wheeler, William [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=352cbf209a0c460ba54523831138b235-Wheeler, William]; Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; Wolverton, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5f7d06177f3e4b75918323aeaa2cee3f-AWolvert]; Klemick, Heather [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=826dccc673744a83b5eaca9f71ece8c0-Klemick, Heather]  
**Subject:** RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation  
**Attachments:** Regulatory Impact Analyses - Basics and Issues (6-9-17).pptx

Enclosed is the latest draft of the ARLO presentation. Chris and I tried to incorporate everyone's concerns but feel free to add additional comments or note where I missed a desired change.

Charles

\*\*\*\*\*

Charles Griffiths  
National Center for Environmental Economics  
Room 4334B, WJC West, Mail Code 1809T  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20460  
Phone: 202/566-0156 Fax: 202/566-2338  
Email: [griffiths.charles@epamail.epa.gov](mailto:griffiths.charles@epamail.epa.gov)

\*\*\*\*\*

---

**From:** Ferris, Ann  
**Sent:** Friday, June 09, 2017 10:46 AM  
**To:** Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Wheeler, William <Wheeler.William@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Klemick, Heather <Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Thanks, Charles.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Ann

564-3207

---

**From:** Griffiths, Charles

**Sent:** Friday, June 09, 2017 8:08 AM

**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Dockins, Chris <[Dockins.Chris@epa.gov](mailto:Dockins.Chris@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer <[Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov)>; Wheeler, William <[Wheeler.William@epa.gov](mailto:Wheeler.William@epa.gov)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <[Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; Wolverton, Ann <[Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov)>; Klemick, Heather <[Klemick.Heather@epa.gov](mailto:Klemick.Heather@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Thank you, Alex. Very helpful.

---

**From:** Marten, Alex

**Sent:** Thursday, June 08, 2017 4:42 PM

**To:** Griffiths, Charles <[Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov](mailto:Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov)>; Dockins, Chris <[Dockins.Chris@epa.gov](mailto:Dockins.Chris@epa.gov)>; Ferris, Ann <[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Ferris.Ann@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer <[Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov)>; Wheeler, William <[Wheeler.William@epa.gov](mailto:Wheeler.William@epa.gov)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <[Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; Wolverton, Ann <[Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov)>; Klemick, Heather

<Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

---

**From:** Griffiths, Charles

**Sent:** Thursday, June 08, 2017 4:03 PM

**To:** Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Wheeler, William <Wheeler.William@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Klemick, Heather <Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>

**Subject:** Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Enclosed are the draft slides for the ARLO presentation on RIAs scheduled for next Tuesday, 10-12. These are the questions that they asked us to address

**Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Message

---

**From:** Marten, Alex [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BBB5E4745E544893B0AA24FA0167A779-MARTEN, ALEX]  
**Sent:** 5/21/2018 10:23:12 PM  
**To:** Jenkins, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=24d256fe39284600871e89c26f9b2613-Jenkins, Robin]  
**Subject:** Re: CPP Replacement Econ Impacts

Thanks Robin. I got held up this afternoon. I will catch up with you tomorrow morning.

--

Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

On May 21, 2018, at 3:01 PM, Jenkins, Robin <[Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov](mailto:Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov)> wrote:

Sure Alex. I'm free now or tomorrow morning works too.

Robin

---

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Monday, May 21, 2018 2:53 PM  
**To:** Jenkins, Robin <[Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov](mailto:Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: CPP Replacement Econ Impacts

Thanks Robin. If you've got a couple minutes today or tomorrow I'd like to bounce a few ideas off you to see how we could beef up the chapter in response to your suggestions.

--

Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

---

**From:** Jenkins, Robin  
**Sent:** Monday, May 21, 2018 2:36 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** CPP Replacement Econ Impacts

Hi Alex,

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I added very few minor edits elsewhere.

Thanks,  
Robin



Message

**From:** Marten, Alex [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BBB5E4745E544893B0AA24FA0167A779-MARTEN, ALEX]  
**Sent:** 7/20/2018 3:04:24 PM  
**To:** Snyder, Brett [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d518eda60c7140919e3f6e366792e578-Snyder, Brett]; Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]  
**CC:** Bowen, Jennifer [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66a625cf6b314520a04341a37cb0da16-JBowen03]; Levitt, Shelley [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c8b9621bd69f46be8c0405a920f38566-SLevitt]  
**Subject:** RE: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--  
Alex Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

---

**From:** Snyder, Brett  
**Sent:** Friday, July 20, 2018 10:57 AM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Levitt, Shelley <Levitt.Shelley@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Hi – thanks for confirming the Murray factsheet is current. Might make sense to keep as separate in event there is attention given to the Murray case in questioning?

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Brett

---

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Friday, July 20, 2018 10:40 AM  
**To:** McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Snyder, Brett <Snyder.Brett@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Levitt, Shelley <Levitt.Shelley@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Happy to help as needed, but with regard to the Murray page I can't think of anything new that needs to be added there.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

---

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Friday, July 20, 2018 10:30 AM  
**To:** Snyder, Brett; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Bowen, Jennifer; Levitt, Shelley  
**Subject:** Re: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

On Jul 20, 2018, at 10:23 AM, Snyder, Brett <[Snyder.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Brett@epa.gov)> wrote:

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Brett

---

**From:** Teplitzky, Andy  
**Sent:** Friday, July 20, 2018 10:06 AM  
**To:** Snyder, Brett <[Snyder.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Brett@epa.gov)>; McGartland, Al <[McGartland.Al@epa.gov](mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov)>; Dalbey, Matthew <[Dalbey.Matthew@epa.gov](mailto:Dalbey.Matthew@epa.gov)>; Thomas, John V. <[Thomas.John@epa.gov](mailto:Thomas.John@epa.gov)>; Pritchard, Eileen <[Pritchard.Eileen@epa.gov](mailto:Pritchard.Eileen@epa.gov)>; Nickerson, William <[Nickerson.William@epa.gov](mailto:Nickerson.William@epa.gov)>; Shaw, Nena <[Shaw.Nena@epa.gov](mailto:Shaw.Nena@epa.gov)>; Tomiak, Robert <[tomiak.robert@epa.gov](mailto:tomiak.robert@epa.gov)>



**Cc:** Campbell, Jennie <[Campbell.Jennie@epa.gov](mailto:Campbell.Jennie@epa.gov)>; Kime, Robin <[Kime.Robin@epa.gov](mailto:Kime.Robin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Greetings everyone. While I don't begin my detail until Monday July 23, I've been asked to move this assignment forward as it requires a quick turnaround. I've attached four Fact Sheets describing resources in four project areas:

- Integrated Environmental Strategies (sectors, community revitalization, OFA-permit streamlining)
- Regulatory/Economic-Management and Analysis (NCEE and maybe ORPM)
- Office of Small and Disadvantaged Business Utilization (ORPM)
- Employment Analysis and the Murray Energy Lawsuit (NCEE?)

**We've been asked to review these fact sheets relevant to OP work and to provide comments, if any, by Noon July 25. Please send me your responses no later than COB July 24, so we have the morning of July 25 to finalize. Please insert your comments/revisions in redline-strikeout. For now, please focus on the text; I am confirming the budget numbers with OEAS.**

For background, here's the incoming email regarding this exercise. Thanks in advance for your work on this.

---

BACKGROUND EMAIL:

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thank you and please let me know if you have any questions. If there are no updates to provide, please let me know that as well.

Christina J. Moody  
US Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Congressional Affairs & Intergovernmental Relations  
[Moody.Christina@epa.gov](mailto:Moody.Christina@epa.gov)

Andy Teplitzky  
U.S EPA, Office of Policy

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Mail Code 1804A, Room 4122B  
Washington, DC 20460

[Teplitzky.andy@epa.gov](mailto:Teplitzky.andy@epa.gov)  
202-566-2947

<fact sheets for OP to revise.pdf>

Message

---

**From:** Heninger, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=6F4118EBAD504477A377E6B4FC4D8BEB-BHENINGE]  
**Sent:** 9/28/2018 9:32:15 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]  
**CC:** Pasurka, Carl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=0c20aa953b914fa8a512c52182b60a56-CPasurka]  
**Subject:** Material on Request for Reconsideration Process  
**Attachments:** RFR 17002A CIO Updates.docx; RFR Process.pdf

Hi Al,

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

## EPA's Information Quality Guidelines *Request for Correction* (RFC) and *Request for Reconsideration* (RFR) Processes

- In 2002, OMB issued guidelines that provide policy and procedural guidance to Federal agencies for ensuring and maximizing the quality, objectivity, utility, and integrity of information disseminated by Federal agencies
- Later that same year, EPA issued its own Information Quality Guidelines (IQG's), which were largely adapted from OMB's guidance. EPA's IQG's provide an administrative mechanism for the public to challenge information disseminated by EPA. These mechanisms are:
  - The Request for Correction (RFC)
  - The Request for Reconsideration (RFR)

**Request for Correction:** When a requester submits a RFC to EPA, the office who disseminated the information, together with OEI and OGC produce a reply which either makes changes to the disseminated information or denies the request. This decision is also reviewed by OMB before being sent back to the requester. However, if the requester is not satisfied with EPA's response, they can file a Request for Reconsideration (which is a bit like an appeal.) OP does not disseminate very much data or other environmental information, so it is rarely involved in the RFC process.

**Request for Reconsideration:** However, when a Request for Reconsideration is submitted to EPA, OP always has a role to play. How the agency decides to respond to a RFR is decided by a three person Executive Panel, which is chaired by EPA's Chief Information Officer, which is usually the AA for OEI. The other panel members are the Science Advisor (from ORD) and EPA's Economics Advisor (which EPA's IQG's define as the Associate Administrator for the Office of Policy.) The response is also reviewed by OGC and goes through OMB for clearance before being sent to the requester.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

his RFR is just beginning and a draft memo on the previous RFC and new RFR is available. However, in this case, ORD, which provides the Science Advisor to the Executive Panel is also the "Information Owner" - the office who disseminated the information being challenged. Therefore, a replacement had to be found to fill their position. In this case, OEI choose Betsy Shaw in OAR, who delegated this role to Erika Sasser (Director, OAR/OAQPS.)

Staff in NCEE administer the IQG's for OP, including the RFRs. They can provide a briefing on the details of each RFR prior to a scheduled meeting of the Executive Panel, and are happy to provide additional information upon request.

### Optional:

#### **Additional Information on the Executive Panel and text regarding replacement of a panel member from the office who disseminated the information**

EPA's *Guidelines for Ensuring and Maximizing the Quality, Objectivity, Utility, and Integrity of Information Disseminated by the Environmental Protection Agency* is what defines the three member Executive Panel (see underlined text below.) The Information Quality Act itself was just a two sentence rider on a spending bill and thus not specific as to how the process is run (it simply states that there should be a process for requesting correction... i.e. agencies should: "establish administrative mechanisms allowing affected persons to seek and obtain correction of information maintained and disseminated by the agency that does not comply with the guidelines ...")

#### **Guidelines for Ensuring and Maximizing the Quality, Objectivity, Utility, and Integrity of Information Disseminated by the Environmental Protection Agency**

##### **8.7 How Does EPA Intend to Process Requests for Reconsideration of EPA Decisions?**

The Assistant Administrator (AA) or Regional Administrator (RA) information owner presents to an executive panel. The executive panel would be comprised of the Science Advisor/AA for the Office of Research and Development (ORD), Chief Information Officer/AA for OEI, and the Economics Advisor/AA for the Office of Policy, Economics and Innovation (OPEI.) The 3-member executive panel would be chaired by the Chief Information Officer/AA for OEI. When the subject of the RFR originated from a member office, that panel member would be replaced by an alternate AA or RA. While the executive panel is considering an RFR, the decision made on the initial complaint by the information owner office or region remains in effect.

### **From Appendix:**

In order to achieve appropriate consistency of response to affected persons on requests for reconsideration and to ensure that cross-cutting information quality issues are considered across the Agency at a senior level, EPA intends for an executive panel to make the final decisions on all requests for reconsideration.

Link to EPA Guidelines: <https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2017-03/documents/epa-info-quality-guidelines.pdf>

OMB Guidelines: [https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/whitehouse.gov/files/omb/assets/OMB/infoereg/iqg\\_oct2002.pdf](https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/whitehouse.gov/files/omb/assets/OMB/infoereg/iqg_oct2002.pdf)

Brian T. Heninger  
Economist, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of the Administrator, Office of Policy  
National Center for Environmental Economics  
4316M EPA-West  
202-566-2270

Message

**From:** Marks, Matthew [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=66CF58C470D84403AF7D7DFD7EFC8016-MARKS, MATTHEW]  
**Sent:** 2/15/2018 7:43:18 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]  
**CC:** HertzWu, Sara [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7a0400db95ae4349a64b5e8babea2077-HertzWu, Sara]; Srinivasan, Gautam [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d69332838210416ba51779b19025f832-GSRINIVA]; Zenick, Elliott [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b2eaa2a560d415fb7c8ce9bb56c7ce5-EZENICK]  
**Subject:** RE: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories  
**Attachments:** Kahal\_report\_final.pdf; Staudt\_report\_final.pdf; ENV\_ENFORCEMENT-#2722240-v1-Ameren\_-\_verification\_for\_supplemental\_response\_to\_rog\_5\_6.DOCX

Okay great. One other thing we need is a verifier for the responses.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if this works for you. If so, just sign the attached Word document, scan, and send it back to me. Happy to answer any questions if necessary.

Matt

<https://www.regulations.gov/document?D=EPA-HQ-OAR-2017-0355-0002>

<https://www.regulations.gov/document?D=EPA-HQ-OAR-2017-0355-0030>

---

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 15, 2018 1:01 PM  
**To:** Marks, Matthew <Marks.Matthew@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Srinivasan, Gautam <Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov>; Zenick, Elliott <Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** HertzWu, Sara <HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories

Hi Matthew,

I just talked to Al. He is fine with the draft, and Brittany doesn't think she needs to be included but defers to OGC on it.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

---

**From:** Marks, Matthew

**Sent:** Thursday, February 15, 2018 8:58 AM

**To:** McGartland, Al <[McGartland.Al@epa.gov](mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <[Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; Srinivasan, Gautam <[Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov](mailto:Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov)>; Zenick, Elliott <[Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov](mailto:Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** HertzWu, Sara <[HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov](mailto:HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories

Sending a reminder to provide comments by cob today.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Marks, Matthew

**Sent:** Tuesday, February 13, 2018 8:22 AM

**To:** McGartland, Al <[McGartland.Al@epa.gov](mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <[Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; 'Gautam Srinivasan' (<[Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov](mailto:Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov)>') <[Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov](mailto:Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov)>; Zenick, Elliott <[Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov](mailto:Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** HertzWu, Sara <[HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov](mailto:HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories

Hi everyone,

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Matt

---

Matthew C. Marks

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Office of General Counsel

Air and Radiation Law Office

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

T: 202-564-3276

E: [marks.matthew@epa.gov](mailto:marks.matthew@epa.gov)

Message

---

**From:** Germann, Sandy [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=02275C87F11648A7B660BA3FA54BEDF6-GERMANN, SANDY]  
**Sent:** 8/20/2018 3:10:12 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]  
**Subject:** FW: New Trump power plant plan would release hundreds of millions of tons of CO2 into the air - The Washington Post

Thanks, Al...I'll see if Daisy wants a holding statement prepared.

Sandy Germann  
US EPA Office of Policy  
202-631-0272  
[germann.sandy@epa.gov](mailto:germann.sandy@epa.gov)

---

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Monday, August 20, 2018 10:58 AM  
**To:** Germann, Sandy <[Germann.Sandy@epa.gov](mailto:Germann.Sandy@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: New Trump power plant plan would release hundreds of millions of tons of CO2 into the air - The Washington Post

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 20, 2018, at 8:57 AM, Germann, Sandy <[Germann.Sandy@epa.gov](mailto:Germann.Sandy@epa.gov)> wrote:

Al, Thanks for the copy on this and the Science Editorial. Do you know the specific topic of the latter?

Sandy Germann  
US EPA Office of Policy  
202-631-0272  
[germann.sandy@epa.gov](mailto:germann.sandy@epa.gov)

---

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Sunday, August 19, 2018 7:18 PM  
**To:** Letendre, Daisy <[letendre.daisy@epa.gov](mailto:letendre.daisy@epa.gov)>; Bolen, Brittany <[bolen.brittany@epa.gov](mailto:bolen.brittany@epa.gov)>; Germann, Sandy <[Germann.Sandy@epa.gov](mailto:Germann.Sandy@epa.gov)>; Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** New Trump power plant plan would release hundreds of millions of tons of CO2 into the air - The Washington Post

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5



# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 9/10/2018 2:50:19 PM  
**To:** Alan Krupnick [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=user732196b2]  
**Subject:** Re: Release and VSL

Thanks. We have not experienced any effort to limit the size of vsl or the use of vsl.

If there was ever a case to limit it — the pm mortality would be the application. And we just did the CPP/ACE rule with out standard VSL treatment.

On Sep 10, 2018, at 10:27 AM, Krupnick, Alan <[Krupnick@rff.org](mailto:Krupnick@rff.org)> wrote:

Hey, Al. Two things.

First, we are going public today.

Second, I saw Sandy Hoffmann who has some evidence that there is a movement to undermine use of (or the size of) the VSL. News to you?

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [<mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 29, 2018 5:32 PM  
**To:** Cohen, Dave <[DCohen@rff.org](mailto:DCohen@rff.org)>; Sullivan, Daniel <[Sullivan@rff.org](mailto:Sullivan@rff.org)>; Krupnick, Alan <[Krupnick@rff.org](mailto:Krupnick@rff.org)>  
**Subject:** These slides are making the rounds at epa.

[https://haqast.wiscweb.wisc.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/91/2018/08/2\\_Sullivan.pdf](https://haqast.wiscweb.wisc.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/91/2018/08/2_Sullivan.pdf)

Sent from my iPhone

Sent from my iPhone

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 8/25/2017 8:03:00 PM  
**To:** Samantha Dravis (dravis.samantha@epa.gov) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ece53f0610054e669d9dffe0b3a842df-Dravis, Sam]  
**CC:** Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]  
**Subject:** the schedule produced by OAR to complete the CPP RIA  
**Attachments:** draft\_interagency\_review\_response\_timeline\_082517.docx

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I do not know if this meets your expectations. I think it provides a way to get this out after proposal but before final. My cell phone is Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 if you want to discuss this. (over the weekend is fine too).

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 2/2/2018 2:06:09 PM  
**To:** Dravis, Samantha [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ece53f0610054e669d9dffe0b3a842df-Dravis, Sam]  
**CC:** Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]; Kime, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7ef7b76087a6475b80fc984ac2dd4497-RKime]  
**Subject:** Enforcement case in court — discovery is delving into the CPP analysis

Hi. OGC contacted me yesterday. An enforcement action against a power plant in Missouri resulted in a court case – the plaintiff is asking a lot of questions about cpp. They want a list of names of people who worked in the CPP RIA. I can fill you in when I see you.  
Sent from my iPhone

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 9/14/2017 3:48:24 PM  
**To:** Kime, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7ef7b76087a6475b80fc984ac2dd4497-RKime]  
**Subject:** Fwd: CPP RIA Memo  
**Attachments:** CPP Repeal RIA Update for OMB.docx; ATT00001.htm

Here it is -- just JN case

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Sasser, Erika" <[Sasser.Erika@epa.gov](mailto:Sasser.Erika@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** September 13, 2017 at 5:15:15 PM EDT  
**To:** "McGartland, Al" <[McGartland.Al@epa.gov](mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Marten, Alex" <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>, "Weatherhead, Darryl" <[Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov](mailto:Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov)>, "Wayland, Robertj" <[Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov](mailto:Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov)>, "Koerber, Mike" <[Koerber.Mike@epa.gov](mailto:Koerber.Mike@epa.gov)>, "Tsirigotis, Peter" <[Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov](mailto:Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov)>, "Harvey, Reid" <[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov](mailto:Harvey.Reid@epa.gov)>, "Snyder, Carolyn" <[Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** CPP RIA Memo

Al—

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Erika

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 8/15/2018 5:09:12 PM  
**To:** Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]  
**Subject:** Cpp RIA — omb review

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 8/14/2018 6:51:19 PM  
**To:** Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]  
**Subject:** Re: CPP RIA edits

Sure. On it now

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 14, 2018, at 2:34 PM, Bolen, Brittany <[bolen.brittany@epa.gov](mailto:bolen.brittany@epa.gov)> wrote:

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Monday, August 13, 2018 5:32 PM  
**To:** Bolen, Brittany <[bolen.brittany@epa.gov](mailto:bolen.brittany@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** CPP RIA edits

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

---

**From:** McGartland, AI [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]  
**Sent:** 5/15/2017 5:20:50 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]  
**Subject:** FW: what is the percent increase in electricity price due to CPP ? (average for nation)  
**Attachments:** cpp-final-rule-ria.pdf

This is no longer on the web site. Dave sent it to me.

---

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 11, 2017 9:53 AM  
**To:** McGartland, AI <McGartland.AI@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: what is the percent increase in electricity price due to CPP ? (average for nation)

AI,

Here is a summary of the percent changes in electricity prices nationally. See page 3-35 of the RIA, which is attached, if you would like to read the discussion of how they were calculated.

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Detailed tables from the RIA follow.

Let me know if you want me to get EIA's projection of the change in electricity price. I'm not sure any outside group provided such information, at least not with some reasonably complete documentation, nationally.

Also, FYI, Alex filled me in on your conversation.

Dave



# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

---

**From:** McGartland, Al

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 10, 2017 2:32 PM

**To:** Marten, Alex <[Marten.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov)>; Evans, DavidA <[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov](mailto:Evans.DavidA@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** what is the percent increase in electricity price due to CPP ? (average for nation)

Message

---

**From:** Ragnauth, Shaun [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13085367E78B4DD49CEF8F4F3CA5BA65-SRAGNAUT]  
**Sent:** 7/12/2018 5:51:15 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]  
**Subject:** RE: draft combined writeup for interim domestic sc-ghgs  
**Attachments:** EO12866 LD CAFE CO2 NHTSA 2127-AL76 EPA PRIA 180710\_Redline.pdf

Hi Elizabeth,

I was just sent a copy of the latest version of the RIA/

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Shaun

---

**From:** Ragnauth, Shaun  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 12, 2018 1:25 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: draft combined writeup for interim domestic sc-ghgs

Hi Elizabeth,

This is fairly straightforward and looks fine to me. I made a couple of minor edits in the attached (

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,  
Shaun

---

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 12, 2018 11:52 AM  
**To:** Ragnauth, Shaun <Ragnauth.Shaun@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** draft combined writeup for interim domestic sc-ghgs

Hi Shaun,

Per our conversation, here's the current draft. Please let me know if I missed anything etc. Happy to discuss any time.

Thanks!

Elizabeth

Message

---

**Sent:** 10/4/2018 6:04:11 PM  
**To:** Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group  
(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]  
**Subject:** Question

Question from ALA regarding tables 4-16 and 6-15 in ACE proposal RIA. These both refer to benefits calculated using “alternate method”—these are Krewski spline tables that didn’t get removed in the scramble to get the RIA done, right?

**Table 4-16 Forgone Climate Benefits and Ancillary Health Co-Benefits using Alternate Method for Representing PM<sub>2.5</sub> Benefits at Low Levels, Relative to Base Case (CPP) (billion 2016\$)**

Message

---

**From:** Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]  
**Sent:** 6/20/2018 2:31:04 PM  
**To:** Sasser, Erika [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=477638fe84004800bfd8e62fe3cafc8-ESASSER]  
**CC:** Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]  
**Subject:** tables requested  
**Attachments:** tables for Erika on 111(d) RIA results.docx

Hi Erika,

Attached is a document summarizing the costs, benefits, and net benefits. This includes comparisons for just the target pollutant, and also our normal approach for benefits. It also includes results compared to the CPP repeal case. All this should be clear in the table titles and section titles.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

- Brian

Brian Keaveny, Economist  
Air Economics Group, HEID/OAQPS  
U.S. EPA Office of Air and Radiation  
MD C439-02, 109 TW Alexander Dr., RTP, NC 27711  
Phone: 919-541-5238